Evaluation of Schemes to Promote Welsh as a Subject
Authors: Buddug Hughes and Iolo Jones

IAITH Cyf.
Unit 3,
Aberarad Business Park,
Newcastle Emlyn,
Carmarthenshire, SA38 9DB

Tel: 01239 711668
E-mail: post@iaith.eu
www.iaith.cymru
Content
Glossary ...................................................................................................................... 4
Tables .......................................................................................................................... 6
1. Introduction ............................................................................................................ 7
2. Background ........................................................................................................... 10
3. Methodology ........................................................................................................ 19
4. Findings ................................................................................................................ 23
5. Conclusions and Recommendations ...................................................................... 55
6. Bibliography ......................................................................................................... 66
7. Appendix ............................................................................................................... 67
Glossary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym/term</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol</td>
<td>Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol creates training and study opportunities through the medium of Welsh by working with further education colleges, universities, apprenticeship providers and employers. The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol inspires and encourages everyone to use their Welsh-language skills. The aim of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol is to build a Welsh-language and bilingual education and training system that is accessible to everyone, and to develop bilingual workplaces.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FE</td>
<td>Further Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualifications Wales</td>
<td>Qualifications Wales is the independent regulator for non-degree qualifications in Wales that are offered by recognised awarding bodies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Qualifications Wales is a body that is independent from the Government and is accountable to the people of Wales through Senedd Cymru.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional Education Consortium</td>
<td>A body that provides education services to support schools in the regions of Wales. There are four Consortia – three local authorities are not part of any consortium, although two of them work with each other.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specification</td>
<td>A specific description of the content of a course of study or curricular syllabus.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEM</td>
<td>The curricular subjects of science, technology, engineering and mathematics.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Term</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Welsh Baccalaureate</strong></td>
<td>The Welsh Baccalaureate qualification is unique to Wales. It helps to prepare students aged between 14 and 19 for the world of work, for further study and for life. The Welsh Baccalaureate qualification is awarded to students that achieve a specified combination of qualifications.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>WESP</strong></td>
<td>Welsh in Education Strategic Plans. Section 84 of the Schools Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013 makes it compulsory for local authorities to prepare a Welsh in Education Strategic Plan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>WG</strong></td>
<td>Welsh Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>WJEC</strong></td>
<td>WJEC is the largest provider of qualifications for schools, sixth-form colleges, and further education colleges across Wales, offering valuable qualifications suitable for a range of abilities. After introducing reformed general qualifications in 2015, the WJEC is now the only provider of qualifications to schools and colleges which is funded by the government across the majority of GCSE and AS/A level subjects.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tables

Table 1. A summary of Schemes to Promote Welsh as a subject  
Table 2. The number of learners that chose to study Welsh as an AS subject 2008-2019  
Table 3. The number of learners that chose to study Welsh as an A level subject 2008-2019  
Table 4. A summary of grants that were awarded to schools and further education colleges from the Welsh in Education Fund  
Table 5. Welsh in Education Fund criteria 2019-2020
1. Introduction

1.1 Since 2011, the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol (the Coleg) has led on the development of Welsh-medium and bilingual education and training in the post-16 sector in Wales. The Coleg creates training and study opportunities through the medium of Welsh by working with further education colleges, universities, apprenticeship providers and employers. The Coleg is a strategic and national planning body, and the Welsh language is at the heart of the Coleg's vision. The Coleg contributes to the planning and building of a Welsh-medium education and training system as part of the Welsh Government's Cymraeg 2050: A Million Welsh Speakers strategy (Welsh Government 2017) to create a million Welsh-speakers.

1.2 IAITH: Welsh Centre for Language Planning was commissioned to conduct an evaluation of Schemes to Promote Welsh as a subject, which the Coleg has implemented between 2018 and 2022, using specific Welsh Government grant funding. These schemes include:

- grants to support the provision of Welsh at AS/A level in secondary schools and further education colleges;
- implementing an internship scheme in Welsh departments in universities;
- creating digital materials to support the teaching of Welsh; and
- a mentoring scheme.

Furthermore, the Coleg has used funding from its main grant to employ an officer to promote Welsh as a subject, who is responsible for coordinating these Promotional Schemes.
The aim of the evaluation

The aim of this evaluation was:

- to investigate how effective the Schemes to Promote Welsh that were funded by the Welsh Government and implemented by the Coleg were in terms of promoting Welsh as a subject between 2018/2019 and 2021/2022 in schools, colleges and universities;

- to investigate whether the Schemes to Promote Welsh achieved their aims; and

- to make recommendations on how to further develop the Schemes to Promote Welsh to ensure improvements in the position of Welsh as a subject and to safeguard the provision for the future.

A summary of the Schemes to Promote Welsh can be seen below.

Table 1: Summary of Schemes to Promote Welsh as a subject

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Scheme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2018-2019</td>
<td>To hold 10 focus groups across Wales (in schools, further education colleges and universities) to improve knowledge of the views and perceptions of learners aged between 14 and 21 that are studying Welsh in order to create a research report (OB3).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Why Choose Welsh A level toolkit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A toolkit to promote Welsh as a subject at parents’ evenings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019-2020</td>
<td>Welsh in Education Fund: supporting schools to ensure the viability of Welsh as an A level subject.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mentoring Project Scheme (led by the University of Cardiff): a programme based on the Mentoring Modern Language Students Scheme ([https://mflmentoring.co.uk](https://mflmentoring.co.uk)). It places students studying Welsh from Swansea, Aberystwyth, Bangor and Cardiff universities in first and second language schools to mentor learners from years 9 and 10.¹

Develop the on-line module, ‘Turning the Tide in Thirty Years’ (led by the University of Wales Trinity St David) and targeted at school-based learners and university students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2020-2021</td>
<td>Welsh in Education Fund for schools and further education colleges.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Taste of Teaching modules: a Scheme that provides a taste of learning to university students as a way of encouraging them to choose a PGCE course after graduation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2021-2022</td>
<td>Welsh in Education Fund for schools and further education colleges.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Internship Scheme: a scheme to employ Welsh students and graduates to promote progression in the subject, from A level to university degree to a PGCE Welsh Secondary course.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ Direct evidence of the implementation of the Mentoring and A Taste of Teaching Schemes has not been gathered. The Mentoring Plan had commenced in 2019 but it was not possible to continue or resume the project due to Covid restrictions until September 2022. It was intended to offer Taste of Teaching modules at three universities from September 2022. Some evidence has been gathered about the attitudes of learners studying Welsh about careers in teaching.
2. Background

2.1 The Welsh Government’s *Cymraeg 2050* (2017) strategy outlines the Welsh Government’s target of creating a million Welsh-speakers by the year 2050. It includes two high level targets: the number of Welsh-speakers to reach one million by 2050; and the percentage of the population that uses Welsh every day and is able to speak more than a few words in Welsh, to increase from 10 percent (2013-2015) to 20 percent by 2050. The strategy has been split into three strategic themes: increasing the number of Welsh-speakers; increasing the use of Welsh and creating favourable circumstances.

2.2 The importance of Welsh as a discipline is more obvious than ever, and increasing the number of people studying Welsh as an A level subject is one of the indicators that is used to monitor progress against *Cymraeg 2050* targets. As well as targets to increase the number of learners in Welsh-medium education and steps to enable them to make progress in their compulsory and post-compulsory education through the medium of Welsh, *Cymraeg 2050* (Welsh Government 2017) includes targets to increase the number of teachers that can teach Welsh as a subject and teach through the medium of Welsh.

2.3 The strategy notes that education is ‘central’ to the government’s vision of reaching a million Welsh-speakers. A target of increasing the proportion of all school groups receiving Welsh-medium education to 40 percent and transforming how Welsh is taught to all learners is included, so that at least 70 percent can report that they can speak Welsh by the time they leave school by 2050. To achieve this, the strategy has targets to increase the number of primary school teachers that can teach through the medium of Welsh to 5,200; to increase the number of secondary teachers that can teach Welsh as a subject to 1,200; and to increase the
number of secondary school teachers that can teach through the medium of Welsh to 4,200, all by 2050.

2.4 Welsh is a compulsory component of the curriculum for all learners until the age of 16 and the Curriculum for Wales – Curriculum for Life (Welsh Government 2015:18) notes that it is a priority to ‘ensure that all learners are able to develop their Welsh language skills and use the language confidently in different contexts’ (Welsh Government 2015:18).

2.5 The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act relates to improving the social, economic, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales. To ensure that the public bodies listed in the act work towards the same vision, seven well-being goals are listed. One of those aims is that Wales has a ‘vibrant culture and a thriving Welsh language’ (National Assembly for Wales 2015).

2.6 The Welsh in Education: Action Plan 2017-2021 contained targets and actions up to 2021 that would contribute to the realisation of the Cymraeg 2050 vision. Increasing the number of learners studying Welsh (first or second language) at A level is identified as an action in the plan, as one way of ensuring an adequate supply of teachers for the future. Specifically, it notes: ‘Work with schools, regional consortia and higher education to ensure that we increase the number of learners studying Welsh and subjects through the medium of Welsh at A-level to ensure that a sufficient supply of future teachers for the Welsh-medium sector.’

2.7 The Subject Benchmarking Statement: Welsh (QAA 2019) defines the academic standards that can be expected of those who have graduated in the subject, in terms of what they could know, do and understand at the end of their studies. The document states that ‘Welsh is a broad and varied academic subject that encompasses language and its literature, from its historic beginnings to the present day, methods of using and promoting the language in a modern context and ensuring that it continues to prosper in the
future. Studying Welsh fosters a flexible and open-minded attitude and also the ability to evaluate different concepts and to present them using appropriate spoken and written language; it enables students to discuss and interpret the cultures and values of the past, as well as developments of the modern world’ (QAA 2019: 3). Furthermore: ‘The contribution made by the subject is central in realising the aspiration of creating a bilingual country. On a national level, the subject contributes to a wide range of fields that characterise a modern civic society (ibid).

2.8 Over the last ten years, a number of research studies and reviews have been conducted on the Welsh language. They include One language for all: A review of Welsh second language at Key Stages 2 and 3 (2013), Estyn’s thematic report, Linguistic progression and standards of Welsh in ten bilingual schools (2014); OB3’s report, Research among young people to discover their views and perceptions of studying Welsh as a subject (2019), and Estyn’s report, A level Welsh First Language (2020). Furthermore, a number of policy documents have been published: Cymraeg 2050 (2017), Education in Wales: Our national mission, Action plan 2017-2021 (2017), Welsh in Education Action Plan 2017-2021 (2021), Guidance on Welsh in Education Strategic Plans (2020). Some of these reports and documents have noted the importance of strategic planning and marketing Welsh in order to increase the numbers of learners who choose to continue studying the subject.

2.9 A consultation on Proposals for a Welsh Language Education Bill will be held by the Welsh Government during Spring 2023. The proposals state that there are challenges to overcome and that changes to existing arrangements are necessary in order to meet Cymraeg 2050 targets. The challenges identified include:

- the need to grow an education workforce with the necessary skills to enable us to expand Welsh-medium education and improve the linguistic outcomes of learners in all schools; and
• the Welsh language skills of learners not in Welsh-medium education (Welsh Government 2023b).

The number of learners that choose to study Welsh post-16

2.10 The number of learners choosing to study Welsh as an AS subject had steadily decreased over the last decade and more, from 281 (first language) and 445 (second language) entries in 2008/2009 to 231 (first language) and 195 (second language) entries in 2019, according to statistics compiled by Stats Cymru. The decline is more evident in the numbers of AS Welsh Second Language.

Table 2: The number of learners that chose to study Welsh as an AS subject 2008-2022

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Welsh</th>
<th>Welsh Second Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2008/09</td>
<td>281</td>
<td>445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009/10</td>
<td>269</td>
<td>474</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>209</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>247</td>
<td>396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015/16</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016/17</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017/18</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018/19</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Stats Cymru

2.11 The number of learners choosing to study Welsh as an A level subject has steadily decreased over the last decade and more, from 304 (first language) and 489 (second

Table 3: The number of learners that chose to study Welsh as an A level subject 2008-2022

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Welsh</th>
<th>Welsh Second Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2008/09</td>
<td>304</td>
<td>489</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009/10</td>
<td>318</td>
<td>410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>302</td>
<td>410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>257</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>287</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015/16</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016/17</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017/18</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018/19</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019/20</td>
<td>244</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020/21</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2021/22</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Stats Cymru

2.12 Such reductions are also evident in the number of learners studying other languages and other Humanities subjects. The 2021/2022 A level Welsh results showed a slight increase in the number of applicants, to 235, and A level Welsh Second
2.13 Other reports have referred to reasons for the reduction in the number of learners studying Welsh at A level. Estyn’s *A level Welsh First Language* (2020) report notes that ‘although the number of pupils that study A level Welsh has fallen over the last decade, the percentage decrease is similar to the decrease in other subjects’ (Estyn 2020:4) and further notes that ‘there was a fall of 30% in the number between 2008-2009 and 2016-2017. However, over the same period, there was a fall of 26% in the total entries for all A level subjects’ (Estyn 2020:14).

2.14 The report also refers to teachers facing constant challenges in promoting Welsh as an A level subject choice as a result of national marketing campaigns promoting other subjects, such as STEM subjects. It is reported that learners at Key Stage 4 who chose not to pursue the subject did so for a number of reasons, including:

- career aspirations;
- they became bored with the GCSE Welsh Literature course;
- the visual literature subjects were old fashioned and dated; and
- perceptions that studying Welsh at A level would only lead to a career as either a teacher or a translator.

2.15 The fact that a number of other courses, such as Psychology, Sociology and Law, were available for study in the post-16 stage, and the introduction of the Welsh Baccalaureate, influenced the fourth choice of some learners who would otherwise have considered studying Welsh at A level (Estyn 2020:16).

2.16 The *Research Report among young people to find out their views and perceptions of studying Welsh as a subject* (OB3 2019: 11)
provides further evidence about the attitudes of learners towards studying Welsh. Many of those questioned as part of the study were not considering studying Welsh at A level for the following reasons:

- there are more interesting subjects than Welsh;
- teachers did not sufficiently promote Welsh as a subject;
- there was no evident value to studying the subject further; and
- there was too much work at GCSE level, which had a negative impact on learner’s aspirations to continue to study the subject.

2.17 In some schools, learners noted that they were restricted in their A level choices as subjects were grouped by the school and therefore subjects needed to be selected to fit with the teaching timetable.

2.18 Since June 2018, representatives from schools, colleges, universities, the regional education Consortia, and a number of other stakeholders including the Welsh Government, Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, Qualifications Wales, WJEC, CYDAG and Urdd Gobaith Cymru have met to discuss different ways of facing the challenge of increasing the numbers of learners studying Welsh after the age of 16. The Stakeholder Group has developed an Action Plan for the Welsh language in education (the document is not available in the public domain). The Action Plan is the result of the work of the Stakeholder Group and specific responsibilities have been assigned in the Action Plan to different stakeholders, including the Coleg. The Welsh Government has provided a Supplementary Grant to the Coleg to undertake those responsibilities since 2018/2019.

2.19 In May 2019, the Welsh Government published the report Action to increase the number of students taking Welsh at A level (Welsh Government 2019b) and to increase the number of Welsh first language and second language teachers by encouraging more 16-
19 year old learners to study Welsh and subjects through the medium of Welsh. It is noted that *the aim is to increase the number of Welsh A-level students to more than a thousand by 2021, in order to increase the number who go on to study Welsh at university and train to become teachers* (Welsh Government 2019b).

2.20 There were also targets to train 200 additional Welsh-medium primary school teachers and 400 additional secondary school teachers, along with 100 more Welsh-medium teachers, compared to 2016. The assumption was that increasing the number of learners studying Welsh at A level would likely increase the number who go on to become Welsh teachers or teach through the medium of Welsh. The Welsh Government provided funding totalling £145,000 in 2019-2020 to support these objectives.

2.21 The importance of increasing the numbers studying Welsh qualifications is reflected in the context of the Welsh in Education Strategic Plans (WESP). Outcome 4 asks Local Authorities to set out how they plan to ensure that *more learners study Welsh (as a subject) and subjects through the medium of Welsh* (Welsh Government 2021a:13).

2.22 The *Welsh in Education Workforce Plan* (Welsh Government 2022) recognises that there is a shortage of people who *study A level in Welsh, who then go on to choose Welsh as a degree and teaching as a career*. Increasing the number is therefore a key element of the Plan, to expand the source of teachers that teach Welsh as a subject, and teachers who can teach subjects through the medium of Welsh more generally.

2.23 **The Iaith Athrawon Yfory Incentive** Scheme for trainee teachers wishing to teach Welsh as a subject or through the medium of Welsh was announced in 2019. The *Iaith Athrawon Yfory Incentive Scheme* supports the *Cymraeg 2050* strategy. The scheme provides grants to trainee teachers to complement the aim of
Cymraeg 2050, namely to increase the number of teachers teaching Welsh as a subject or teaching through the medium of Welsh.

2.24 The Welsh in Education Workforce Plan was published by the Welsh Government in 2022. It is a 10-year plan covering how the Welsh Government will take steps to develop the Welsh workforce in schools. It is set out in the plan that the education system serves a vital role in increasing the number of Welsh-speakers, by increasing the number of learners in Welsh-medium or bilingual education and also by ensuring that all learners in Wales have the opportunity to develop their Welsh language skills sufficiently in order to use it in all aspects of life.

The Covid Pandemic

2.25 On Wednesday 18 March 2020 the Welsh Government announced that all educational institutions in Wales would close from Friday 20 March 2020 at the latest. Between then and 13 April 2021 schools and colleges in Wales were closed for learners a number of times. The pandemic affected how schools and colleges operated and their ability to carry out some of the activities organised through plans to promote Welsh as a subject through the Coleg’s funding.
3. **Methodology**

3.1 In consultation with the Coleg’s officers, the evaluation was held through the following steps:

- agree on the aim, scope and focus of the work with the Coleg’s officers;
- hold scoping interviews with one of the Coleg’s officers;
- conduct desktop research, becoming familiar with the relevant documentation;
- conduct a survey with educators in centres that had received funding from the Welsh in Education Fund during the 2019-2022 period. We also invited schools that had received grant funding, schools that had not submitted an application, and schools that had been unsuccessful with their applications, to contribute. The survey was opened on 16 December 2022 and the survey closed on 30 January 2023. The survey was shared via a link, which was sent via e-mail by an officer of the Coleg to the e-mail addresses of teachers that they had on their data base, and it was also sent to the Consortia and CYDAG for distribution;
- produce semi-structured interview questions to be used in interviews and focus groups;
- conduct interviews with a sample of teachers that had agreed to take part in follow-on interviews, stakeholder representatives and university lecturers between 09/02/2023 and 27/02/2023;
- sort and evaluate the responses, using Braun and Clarke’s (2006) thematic evaluation methods;
- produce a draft report for the attention of the Coleg’s officers;
- present a final report for the attention of the Coleg’s officers.
Limitations

3.2 Due to the restrictions of this evaluation’s tight schedule, the fieldwork was required to take place between December 2022 and February 2023. This was a period of industrial action in the schools and higher education sector. There have been challenges in terms of being able to arrange interviews and focus groups in these circumstances. When discussing the numbers studying Welsh A level at schools/colleges between 2019 and 2022, it must be kept in mind that the survey responses do not include all centres/schools that received funding, but the responses provide an insight into the situation of some schools funded through the Plan.

Fieldwork

Survey

3.3 32 educators responded to the survey and the majority of respondents were Heads of Welsh Departments/Welsh Subject Leaders. 3 reported that they had not applied for funding from the Welsh Language in Education Fund at some point between 2018/2019 and 2021/2022 (although the Coleg has a record that two of their schools have applied in the past – these differences are likely due to staffing changes in the schools).

3.4 The schools/colleges that had received grant funding offered the following provision for Welsh as a subject:

- GCSE Welsh Language (First Language): 21
- GCSE Welsh Literature: 20
- GCSE Welsh Second Language: 16
- A level Welsh (First Language): 20
- A level Welsh (Second Language): 12

3.5 Nine centres that responded to the survey offered second language provision only, four offered first and second language
provision and 19 offered first language provision only. Six of the schools offered GCSE first and second language provision.

3.6 **Focus Groups**

3.7 Following discussions with the Coleg’s officers, a total of 11 focus groups were held with learners from various locations across Wales (including Welsh-medium schools, bilingual schools, further education colleges and university students). Focus groups were held face-to-face at the following schools:

- A Bilingual School based in north-west Wales: GCSE Group (9 members), Welsh First language learners and A level Group (6 members), learners speak Welsh First language and two of them studying Welsh A level.
- A Welsh medium School based in south-west Wales: GCSE Group (10 members), learners study Welsh First language and a group of A level learners (8 members).
- An English medium School based in south-east Wales: GCSE Group (8 members) and an A level group (6 members) (the school offers Welsh Second Language provision).
- An English medium School based in the south Wales valleys: GCSE Group (6 members) and an A level group (6 members) (the school offers Welsh Second Language provision).

3.8 Virtual focus groups were held with further education learners:

- A Further Education College in north-east Wales: Year 12/13 (4 members) studying A level Welsh Language.
- A Further Education College in north-west Wales: Year 12/13 (3 members) studying A level Welsh Second Language.

3.9 A virtual focus group was held with students studying for an undergraduate degree in Welsh at two universities (6 members).

**Interviews**
3.10 A series of virtual interviews were held:

- Follow-on interviews with teachers/further education lecturers that had responded to the survey (5 interviews).
- Interviews with former university students that were part of the Coleg’s internship scheme (2 interviews).
- Interviews with stakeholders representing the education Consortia, a university, and a qualification awards body (3 interviews).

3.11 The contributions made by the above individuals are confidential. A composite impression of their comments is presented below, highlighting the difference of opinion as appropriate and relevant.

3.12 We considered the information that was submitted to us in many relevant documents:

- The minutes of a stakeholders’ committee meeting to increase the numbers studying Welsh.
- A summary of grant activity pertaining to Promoting Welsh as a Subject.
- Introduction to the work of the Coleg: Promoting Welsh as a Subject.

Ethical Considerations

3.13 Intellectual consent was gathered from learners, educators, officers and the Coleg’s stakeholders who took part in the evaluation. Information on their contribution to the evaluation and use of their personal data was provided in a privacy notice circulated before interviews and focus groups were held.
4. Findings

4.1 The findings that are presented in this section are based on the evidence referred to in Section 3 of this report.

4.2 The vast majority (97 percent) of those that responded to the survey noted that there are challenges in terms of recruiting learners to study Welsh A level (First and Second Language) at the centres.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Challenges</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No challenges</td>
<td>3.45%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenges</td>
<td>96.55%</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.3 The challenges that were noted included:

- **The learners themselves** – learners do not see the value of the Welsh language and cannot see its value beyond Wales.
- **The perception that it is only through STEM subjects** that it is possible to ensure a place at a prestigious university (Oxford, Cambridge etc).
- **A lack of specialist staff** to be able to offer Welsh A level as a subject, and the challenge of recruiting Welsh teachers.
- **A lack of Welsh A level learners**, and therefore a lack of ‘ambassadors’ to promote the subject amongst younger pupils.
- **A lack of support for English medium schools** in terms of teaching Welsh as a subject.
- **A lack of support from parents** towards Welsh as a subject and the perception amongst parents that Welsh has no value.
- **The appeal of new subjects** and too much choice of subjects.
- The perception that learners **gain better grades** in other subjects.
- **Clashes with** other subjects in the same column on school timetables.
- **Shortcomings in the GCSE course** – the subject is too difficult and is ‘boring and uninspiring’. There is a perception that GCSE Welsh courses do not encourage people to move on to study Welsh A level.
• **Shortcomings in the A level course** – a perception that the course is challenging and a perception that there is a big leap between GCSE and A level Welsh.

• The perception that Welsh only leads to a career as a teacher and a mindset that ‘Welsh will not help you get on in the world’.

**The impact of Covid on plans to promote Welsh as a subject**

4.4 According to the evidence of a number of survey respondents, Covid affected the implementation of the Schemes to Promote Welsh in the schools/colleges. Covid impacted the decision of centres to apply to enrich learners' experiences and the ability to deliver subject enrichment activities beyond the boundaries of the classroom. In the survey, it was noted that the grant funding had contributed to paying for on-line sessions with external speakers for learners. Prior to the pandemic, the organisation of trips had led to increased A level learner numbers in some schools but, due to lockdown restrictions, such visits were much more limited. Some centres said they had seen a marked reduction in the number of people taking A level Welsh during 2020/2021 due to Covid.

4.5 In the opinion of some respondents, GCSE learners were not as confident compared to before the pandemic. One reason that was suggested was that it is difficult to learn a second language without regular, face-to-face practice. It was also noted that a significant number of pupils lost their confidence during the lockdown periods, especially in second language schools. Covid had created difficulties for learners when it came to choosing post-16 options, because they were ‘unable to meet people and you had to do everything on-line’.

**The Welsh in Education Grant Fund**

4.6 One of the core aims of the Plan to Promote Welsh as a Subject is to support schools to offer Welsh A level courses. Since 2019, the Coleg has offered Welsh in Education Grant Funding to schools
and colleges for the provision of AS/A level Welsh and AS/A level Welsh Second Language.

4.7 Between 2019 and 2022, the Welsh in Education Grant awarded the following funding:

**Table 4: Summary of grants that were awarded to schools and further education colleges from the Welsh in Education Fund**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of grants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2019-2020</td>
<td>Grants worth between £800 and £2,000 were awarded to 56 schools and 6 further education colleges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020-2021</td>
<td>Grants worth between £750 and £3,000 were awarded to 27 schools and 6 further education colleges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2021-2022</td>
<td>Grants worth between £1,000 and £3,000 were awarded to 40 schools and 4 further education colleges</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**The application process**

4.8 Schools and colleges apply for grant funding in May or June; awarded funding can be claimed from July onwards, for the following academic year. It has been possible to make applications on-line for the first time during the 2019-2020 academic year.

**2019/2020**

4.9 The first year of the Welsh in Education Fund was a pilot scheme and was open to schools offering AS/A level Welsh courses and to schools and further education colleges offering AS/A level Welsh Second Language courses.

4.10 The criteria were based on the numbers of learners studying AS/A level Welsh or AS/A level Welsh Second Language and on the intended use of the funding, i.e. eligible expenditure. Examples of eligible expenditure include a contribution to provision costs, travel costs to transport students from one site to another, a contribution to pay for activities, e.g. trips, guest speakers and conferences.
Table 5: Welsh in Education Fund criteria 2019-2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of learners studying AS / A level Welsh</th>
<th>Maximum Grant</th>
<th>Eligible expenditure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Category 1 1-4</td>
<td>£3,000</td>
<td>Contribution to the cost of maintaining the provision. The grant could also be used to support activities to enrich teaching.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category 2 5-8</td>
<td>£2,000</td>
<td>Contribution to the cost of maintaining the provision. The grant could also be used to support activities to enrich teaching.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category 3 9+</td>
<td>£1,000</td>
<td>To support activities to enrich teaching.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.11 One amount of funding was available per school or college, but could be used to support provision in Year 12 and/or 13. Priority has been given to applications in the following order:

- Category 1
- Category 2
- Category 3

2019-2020

4.12 In 2019, 65 applications were received from schools and colleges from 22 Local Authorities, and 62 of them were eligible for funding. Funding was awarded to 56 schools and 6 colleges. 55 percent of applications supported first language provision, 40 percent supported second language provision, and 5 percent supported first and second language provision. 16 percent of funding was awarded for supporting provision, 80 percent for enrichment of experience and 4 percent for both purposes.
For the academic year 2020/2021, 33 applications were received from schools and colleges across 17 Local Authorities. 21 schools/colleges had applied for grant funding in 2019-2020 and there were 12 applications from schools/colleges who had not previously applied. Applications were received from 27 schools and 6 colleges. 61 percent of applications supported Welsh first language provision, and 39 percent supported Welsh second language provision. The grants have been awarded as follows:
Data source: Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol

Grant funding was allocated between categories in the following order:

- Category 1  10 percent
- Category 2  30 percent
- Category 3  60 percent

2021-2022

4.14 Submission conditions were adjusted for academic year 2021-2022. If a grant from the Fund was received in the 2019/2020 or 2020/2021 school year, and the funding was unspent, it could be carried over to the 2021/2022 school year. It was not possible to submit an additional application for 2021/2022. If a grant was received and the funding used in 2020/2021, a new application could be made.

4.15 Academic year 2021-2022 included two grant categories:

1) Up to £3,000 to ensure A level Welsh First Language/A level Welsh Second Language (a portion of the grant could also be used to enrich learner experiences).
2) Up to £1,000 to enrich Year 12 and/or Year 13 learner experiences that study Welsh as a subject.

There was one sum of grant funding available per school or college. It was not possible to apply for Category 1 and 2 grant funding.

4.16 46 applications were received from schools and colleges from 18 Local Authorities, and 40 schools and 4 colleges were awarded grants. 39 percent of applications were for supporting first language Welsh centres, 41 percent for supporting second language Welsh centres, and 20 percent of applications were for supporting bilingual schools.

4.17 19 (43 percent) of schools/colleges applied for Category 1 funding (enriching provision) and 25 (57 percent) of schools/colleges applied for Category 2 funding (to support provision).
Data source: Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol

Educators’ response to the Welsh in Education Fund

4.18 The majority of survey respondents had applied for funding from the Welsh in Education Fund sometime between 2018/2019 and 2021/2022. Two schools/colleges had not applied, either because they were unaware of the Fund or because the school/college did not have a Welsh A level class. The vast majority of survey respondents had applied for experience enrichment purposes.

4.19 The main reasons noted by survey respondents for applying for grant funding from the Welsh in Education Fund included:

- to facilitate the continuation of Welsh A level provision, despite the low number of learners at a centre;
- to provide learners with experiences (including trips and guest speakers) and to buy resources;
- to contribute to residential courses and, by doing so, enriching learner experiences;
• to highlight the advantages of the subject beyond the classroom;
• to create opportunities to meet other learners;
• to create opportunities for learners to gain confidence in their skills;
• to create opportunities to experience Welsh-language culture.

Applying for Welsh in Education grant funding

4.20 All 29 centres that applied for grant funding (those that noted that their organisation had applied for grant funding between 2018/2019 and 2021/2022) were successful, and every one of the 20 organisations noted that the process of submitting an on-line application in 2021/2022 was straightforward.

The timing of applications

4.21 The majority of respondents (25 of the 29, or 86 percent of those that applied for funding) noted that the summer term was the appropriate time to submit applications for funding for the subsequent academic year. However, a representative of the Consortia thought that timing could be a problem on occasion because the Coleg cannot distribute the funding until it receives the funds from the Government. Some respondents also noted that September, after GCSE results had been published and when there was more certainty about the number of students that would be studying the subject, was the best time – learners were weighing up their options between receiving their results in August and returning to school in September. Another respondent was of the opinion that the summer term was too late, because decisions are made with regard to centres' timetables during the spring term.

Reasons for applying to the Welsh in Education Fund

4.22 The majority of survey respondents had applied to the Fund for funding to enrich learners' experiences between 2019 and 2022.
One respondent\textsuperscript{2} specifically indicated that they had applied for funding to enhance experience and provision, but the number of respondents to questions about provision and experience separately suggests that some respondent centres had applied for different elements of funding in different years. The diagram below shows the main reasons that respondents applied to the Fund between 2019 and 2022.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To ensure the provision of A level Welsh as a subject</td>
<td>31.03%</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To enrich Year 12 and/or Year 13 (Year 1 and 2 at college) learner experiences that study Welsh as a subject</td>
<td>96.55%</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To enrich experiences and provision</td>
<td>3.45%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textbf{Funding applications to enrich learner experiences}

4.23 In some schools/colleges, securing funding to enrich experiences (e.g. a trip) meant that learners did not have to pay to go on a trip and exemptions did not occur due to affordability or cost. In those schools, not all learners would have been able to go on a trip (e.g. because of cost in the past), but the grant funding allowed access to trips for all learners studying Welsh A level courses.

\textsuperscript{2} During the 2020-2021 and 2019-2020 periods of the Fund, it was possible to apply for funding for both purposes (provision and experience). There may have been only one respondent because respondents believed that the questionnaire referred to this arrangement (i.e. an application for one-period funding for two purposes).
Reference was made to the ‘Learner's Voice’ conversations in schools, where it was discerned that ensuring experiences and opportunities beyond the classroom was the main attraction for learners in choosing to continue to study Welsh - opportunities to visit highly relevant locations for the courses, attend residential courses and meet speakers, whether poets, authors or academics, which developed learners' understanding of various aspects of the course.

There were considerable references to applying for funding in order to ensure that learners could enrich their experiences of studying Welsh by attending specialist sessions organised by universities at the Glan-llyn centre, being able to visit the theatre and being able to pay visitors to visit the school. Some centres made requests to enable learners to experience provision of the same standard as other centres. ‘[We are applying for the funding] to provide the same opportunities [as other schools],’ a respondent said, before adding: ‘our children have fewer opportunities than other schools’.

Funding applications to maintain provision

Centres could apply to the Fund for funding to be able to maintain provision, for example to assist in being able to offer Welsh A level and Welsh A level Second Language provision for small cohorts of learners. Some centres noted that they would not have been able to offer provision without the financial support – these types of comments were more common amongst centres that offered Welsh as a Second Language. Some centres had policies where a minimum of 3 learners had to choose a subject before the subject was available for Year 12. ‘In recent years, we have had a difficult time attracting the necessary number of learners. Therefore, by receiving this funding, we are able to offer some kind of provision to learners in the school’, said one respondent. Another centre noted that their financial position meant that they could not hold A
level classes with fewer than 10 learners. The survey responses referred to the need to have a minimum of between 3 and 10 learners following the courses at some centres.

4.27 In some cases, the funding contributed to funding a partnership between schools where learners received lessons on two sites, in order to offer more options to study Welsh. The funding was used to contribute to the travel costs and other costs of maintaining the partnership.

4.28 A centre said that in order to encourage more students to study Welsh A level they were applying for funding to support provision. They wanted to create links with English-medium school learners through masterclasses, to encourage them to choose Welsh as an A level subject at the local further education college.

The impact of receiving funding from the Welsh in Education Fund

4.29 29 respondents (70 percent) noted that there had been changes at their centres as a result of the funding.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Changes</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>68.97%</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No changes</td>
<td>31.03%</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.30 The impacts noted by respondents included being able to continue to provide Welsh as a subject when learner numbers were low, an increase in the number of learners wanting to study Welsh as a subject, enriching the learner experience, and creating links with other schools/colleges.

4.31 The impacts of receiving the funding on learners, according to respondents, included: increasing confidence, increasing motivation and interest, and in some centres all learners were able to participate in activities (not just those who could afford to do so). This was a characteristic of responses from centres in deprived areas.
According to three second language centres, one bilingual school and a further education college, receiving funding for provision had contributed to being able to maintain provision in their centres for small groups of learners. Respondents from two schools offering Welsh A level Second Language said that if their centres had not received grant funding, they would not have been able to continue to maintain their Welsh A level provision. The financial situation of the centres also affected the provision of courses. There were restrictions on offering a course if there were not enough learners to reach minimum numbers for offering the subject. As noted in paragraph 4.26, some schools had policies where it was necessary to have a minimum number of learners choosing Welsh before being able to offer the subject in Year 12. Three second language centres stated that they had applied to enable A level provision to be offered as a result of small numbers of learners wishing to take the course. A few centres were using the provision funding to deliver the A level course through a digital service (e-sgol) when there were insufficient numbers within the centre.

The impact of the plan on the number of learners

Just under a quarter of the centres that responded to the survey had seen an increase in numbers, just under a quarter had seen a decrease in numbers and, in just under half of the centres, the numbers had remained around the same as they were before receiving funding from the Welsh in Education Fund.

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increase</td>
<td></td>
<td>24.14%</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decrease</td>
<td></td>
<td>27.59%</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stayed</td>
<td>approximately the same</td>
<td>48.28%</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to respondents, and also those that took part in follow-on interviews, the reasons for the reduction in numbers of learners
studying Welsh A level included aspects on how the subject is promoted, and the subject had become less attractive because of the content of the courses. Frequent references were made to a perception amongst learners that GCSE Welsh was sufficient in the job market, and that learners did not see the value in studying Welsh any further following GCSE.

4.35 Among the reasons offered for an increase in numbers, were that learners were now seeing more value in Welsh; there were more extra-curricular opportunities and learners saw that activities were being offered to those studying Welsh (e.g. being able to invite external speakers to school/college, arranging trips and visits that are relevant to the content of the A level courses). It was suggested that a more varied offer of activities, which had been provided due to funding support, to support experiences, had increased the appeal of the subject to learners. One centre had seen an increase from one learner following the course in 2019 to seven in 2022. There was no clear reason for the increase at the centre, other than a feeling that ‘attitudes to the language are changing’. Another suggestion was that the Covid pandemic had transformed learning (mixed learning methods) and the appeal to follow the course had increased as a result.

Support for teachers and lecturers to teach Welsh A level

4.36 Just over half of the survey respondents felt that there was sufficient support for teachers and lecturers to be able to teach Welsh A level at the school/college.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sufficient support</th>
<th>Insufficient support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55.17%</td>
<td>44.83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the respondents, the type of support that would now be useful to educators included:

- **resources**: more resources highlighting the benefits of the subject, a further pool of centralised resources, more sharing
of resources (notes on specialist areas or aspects of some units, e.g. ‘the music in the Hedd Wyn film’);

- **collaborative** learning and teaching;
- more **courses, workshops and guest speakers**;
- specific events to persuade parents and learners of the value of the Welsh language;
- an opportunity to **share experiences** with other teachers and to share expertise;
- more **training** on how to teach specific aspects of the course.

**Progression to studying Welsh at higher education level**

4.37 The survey asked how many learners from the centre had gone on to study Welsh at university since 2019. Of the 32 centres that responded, 107 of their learners had gone on to study Welsh at university between 2019 and 2022.

4.38 A university lecturer reported that the first-year undergraduate numbers during the last three years had improved and was quite consistent in the Welsh department that they represented, and had steadily increased to over twenty enrolled individuals on an undergraduate Welsh course, where the numbers had been less than 15 previously.

**Other elements of the Plan to Promote Welsh as a Subject**

4.39 *Plans to promote Welsh as a subject* have included other elements, in addition to providing financial support for A level courses through the Welsh in Education Fund. These elements include:

- a Why Study Welsh toolkit;
- *Turning the Tide in Thirty Years* on-line module;
- materials to promote and market Welsh as a subject;
- teaching materials on the *Y Porth* website;
- an internship scheme.
Why Study Welsh toolkit

4.40 The *Why Study Welsh* toolkit was developed by the Coleg, the Welsh Government and other partners in 2019. Teachers were consulted and research was conducted into young people’s perceptions to create a series of resources to encourage learners to choose Welsh as a subject, focusing on enjoyment, skills and career opportunities. This work was part of a national scheme to raise awareness of the benefits of continuing to study Welsh. The materials were flexible, and it was possible to use them in various modes - posters or flyers, to be incorporated into PowerPoint or Prezi presentations in subject selection evenings and used on social media accounts. One was also a video clip. The toolkit is available on *Y Porth* and resources are available in Welsh and English.

4.41 The survey asked educators whether they had seen/received a *Why Study Welsh* toolkit from the Coleg (also known as the ‘Promoting Welsh as a Subject Toolkit’). Less than half (12) of the respondents were aware of it (41 percent).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Had seen the toolkit</th>
<th>41.38%</th>
<th>12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Had not seen the toolkit</td>
<td>58.62%</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.42 The respondents that used the toolkit had used it in the following ways:

- displaying the material in classrooms/6th form common rooms at schools/colleges;
- sharing the material with learners/at the end of KS4 lessons;
- using the material during subject introductory evenings and parents’ evenings;
- using the materials on Welsh departments' Instagram accounts;
- using the material digitally to update material; and
- marketing the department (versions for learners and parents).
Some respondents were new heads of department and believed that the materials had not been transferred to them.

Turning the Tide in Thirty Years

4.43 The *Turning the Tide in Thirty Years* module looks at the importance of good Welsh-language skills in the workplace. It specifically considers the advantages of continuing to study Welsh post-GCSE. The module is mainly aimed at learners and students in schools, further education colleges and universities.

4.44 The survey asked whether the *Turning the Tide in Thirty Years* was used at the school/college. It must be remembered that this resource was not specifically created for use by schools/colleges, it is aimed at post-compulsory learners in all sectors. The overwhelming majority of respondents did not use it – only 2 respondents (7 percent) reported using it.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Had used the module</th>
<th>6.90%</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Had not used the</td>
<td></td>
<td>93.10%</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>module</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.45 Respondents who had seen the module reported that they use a few video clips in assemblies/sessions to promote Welshness, and had used it during a unit of work looking at the world of work with younger pupils.

Materials to promote and market Welsh as a subject

4.46 The survey asked whether respondents had seen the Coleg’s materials to promote and market Welsh as a subject on social media, e.g. Instagram (@DyDdyfodolDi and @InstaGymraeg), Twitter (@DyDdyfodolDi and @CymraegCCC).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Had seen the materials</th>
<th>65.52%</th>
<th>19</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Had not seen the</td>
<td></td>
<td>34.48%</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>materials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.47 The responses from educators that had seen the materials were overwhelmingly positive. Many said they were suitable and appealing, ‘attractive’ and ‘age appropriate’. Some respondents had used InstaGymraeg materials extensively in advertising the subject and regularly ‘retweeted’ or ‘shared’ from the department’s social media accounts. The Consortia representative considered that the universities' on-line provision was very successful and that the Coleg’s marketing was appealing: ‘they understand their audience particularly well on Instagram and reflect how young people think’.

4.48 There was some criticism of the material that was on social media, for example, that there was insufficient coverage for second language learners: ‘there needs to be a better platform for second language learners in order to build the confidence of learners from similar backgrounds that the Welsh second language qualification is within their reach’.

4.49 Centres were asked whether they refer learners to the Coleg’s social media posts that promote and market Welsh as a subject. Over half of the respondents did this.

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>62.07%</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>37.93%</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.50 Respondents explaining their reasons for not sharing these materials with learners, said they that did not do because:

- they had never heard about the materials;
- they had not had any time to use them;
- they did not use social media;
- they had not thought to do so; and
- they had no intention of doing so.

Awareness of the Coleg’s materials that promote Welsh as a subject amongst learners

4.51 There was some awareness of the Coleg’s social media materials amongst undergraduate students and some had seen the material
on Instagram. There was a view that raising awareness through social media was useful but that school visits were also effective, although social media reached a wider audience.

4.52 Among undergraduate students, there was a view that posts from colleges and universities on social media helped them to decide which higher education courses to follow. One said it was nice to see that universities are so keen to attract people, and that this creates the impression that students are welcome. One university's posts, for example, reinforced the idea that there were several career options available from taking a Welsh degree course - this was important because of the public perception that teaching and translating were the only careers available to those that studied for a degree in Welsh.

E-learning resources

4.53 Knowledge about digital and e-learning resources available to support GCSE and A level studies was low. A level learners were aware of the WJEC website (and turned to it for more information about the poetry). One centre had used the resources on Y Porth, the Coleg’s resource website, for study sessions on the novel, and also subscribed to the Coleg’s YouTube channel. On the other hand, at one of the A level centres, no one was familiar with Y Porth and no one had used the Welsh lectures/ study sessions that are provided by universities.

4.54 There wasn't much awareness among GCSE groups in one centre of the Coleg’s posts on social media. One learner had seen promotional material, as the school's Instagram account shared the content. The college's promotional materials (Instagram etc) were shown to learners, but the material was not familiar to many of them. However, when the materials were shared as part of the focus groups, many were of the view that the material was modern and appealing. Learners noted that concise material was more appealing than substantial material.
4.55 Some members of the A level focus groups had seen adverts by colleges and universities – although these focused more on praising their locations and resources, rather than the courses on offer. At one of the centres, no one had paid much attention to these kinds of materials. In the material that some had seen, there was no focus on Welsh courses or courses through the medium of Welsh. It was noted that universities did do a great deal of on-line promotion work about open days. The main message from learners at one centre was: ‘They mention pass rates, but so what?’ They did not consider this kind of information to be relevant.

4.56 Members of the focus groups placed great emphasis on the need to sell the experience to students and to show them what kind of place the university is and the types of accommodation that are available to them. They would appreciate videos by other ‘normal’ students that share experiences of day-to-day life, the campus and rooms etc. It was noted that this would help many young people that suffer from anxiety. They believed that some of the young people that are used as case studies on promotional material are well-known public figures, and that they would appreciate seeing more ‘normal’ people to be able to identify with them.

**Internship Scheme**

4.57 Another aspect of the *Plan to Promote Welsh as a Subject* is the university internship scheme, which was introduced during the 2021-2022 academic year. The Coleg’s internship opportunities were advertised through the universities, which received funding from the Coleg in order to recruit and employ the interns. It was necessary for applicants to submit an application and attend an interview. Four interns were appointed in spring 2022. Responsibilities were tailored to the interns’ interests, and were varied. Their responsibilities included:

- creating social media content (mainly Instagram);
• providing study advice to younger learners;
• summarising information about A level courses;
• contributing to organising events and engaging with participants during on-line sessions or Q&A sessions, to describe their experiences of studying Welsh;
• working on the Coleg’s stall at Eisteddfod yr Urdd and the National Eisteddfod;
• organising a residential course for Year 12 students (at one of the universities); and
• contributing to university open days.

4.58 The interns felt that they had worked well with the Coleg’s officer. However, the supervision and relationship with the Welsh Departments in the universities varied between the four interns, and the support provided by Welsh departments also varied. A university lecturer thought that more information about internship schemes and visiting schools would be beneficial, and that the Welsh departments in the universities could therefore support them better.

4.59 One intern suggested there should be more direct involvement with younger learners, instead of the increasing emphasis on social media, and that visiting schools would be useful. One intern had created a data base of contacts that included people that had studied Welsh and had gone on to have successful careers, and had conducted research with the Welsh department to create profiles of former students.

Influences on the decisions of learners to study a Welsh course

Undergraduate students

4.60 Undergraduate students were asked for the reasons why they chose to study for a degree in Welsh. Reasons included:

• Welsh was their strongest subject and the course allowed for elements of tailoring in accordance with personal interests within the discipline;
They had enjoyed studying Welsh A level (although some felt that the course was heavy, especially when studying the novel and medieval prose);

- The creative elements of the A level course appealed to some learners, and this had influenced their decisions to continue to study the subject at undergraduate level;

- Learners had enjoyed attending lessons in small groups, and felt that these were more similar to discussions or workshops, and this had appealed to them.

Glan-llyn Welsh A level Course

4.61 During their time studying the Welsh A level course, the majority of the focus group members attended a Welsh course at Glan-llyn, organised by Bangor University’s School of Welsh. The course had appealed to them because it was a pleasant experience to be with other people who wanted to study Welsh A level, they had met many people who are now studying the same course, and they were in a learning environment, but having fun as well.

University open days

4.62 University open days and taster lectures provided learners with an insight into university life. Open days had convinced one of the focus group’s contributors to study Welsh rather than another course they had intended to follow. Another student liked the personal letters from a university inviting her there.

Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol Ambassadors

4.63 Half of the members of the undergraduate focus group had been Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol Ambassadors – either in secondary school, or at university. One participant said that being an ambassador during her second year at university was one of her best experiences, she had enjoyed attending the Eisteddfod and encouraging people to learn Welsh.
Choosing an A level course

Learners at schools and further education centres received information from a variety of sources, including parents, teachers and careers advisors, before choosing their A level courses. ‘Introductory evenings’ were mentioned, an evening where teachers introduced subject options, and an ‘options fair’ which showcased information and provided opportunities to talk to learners who were currently studying the different subjects. Some Year 13 learners had an on-line ‘introduction to options’ evening due to the lockdown restrictions at the time. Parents’ evenings were also held in centres. Information leaflets, a prospectus or a digital subject handbook have been proposed.

Reasons for choosing or not choosing a Welsh A level course

In schools, the focus groups included learners who had chosen to study Welsh as well as learners who had not chosen Welsh for their post-16 studies. The reasons for choosing to study Welsh included:

- good GCSE grades and enjoying the subject;
- wanting to study a different field to the other scientific subjects that had been chosen;
- Welsh was part of their identity and it was natural to choose to study it as a subject;
- wanting to study Welsh to learn about the culture;
- Welsh complemented the other subjects that had been chosen;
- being passionate about the language;
- an aspiration to teach Welsh at a secondary school in the future, which meant that choosing the subject was key to this particular career pathway.
4.66 All participants in the further education A level group were studying Welsh A level and wanted to pursue a career as teachers. One said she wanted to pursue a career as a primary school teacher and was hoping to study Welsh at university and ‘they were crying out for Welsh teachers’.

4.67 Amongst participants of A level focus groups that did not study Welsh, the reasons for not continuing included:

- other subjects appealed more to them than Welsh;
- no interest in studying literature;
- an aspiration to work abroad, and a feeling that Welsh would not be useful career-wise;
- an aspiration to follow medical/veterinary careers, which means studying scientific subjects; and
- a clash in the school or college’s timetable between Welsh and other subjects.

4.68 Members of the focus groups had either enjoyed studying Welsh or were enjoying studying Welsh at school. Many felt that there was a good balance between coursework and examinations, and this was a factor that influenced them to choose the subject. Some referred to enjoying the study of novels and the oral elements of the GCSE and A level courses. However, opinions were mixed in relation to the poetry elements of the courses. The novels that were studied were more modern than the poetry and were easier to understand and discuss. Some learners wanted to see changes to the courses, to include elements such as ‘translating and things I could use in the future’.

Visits and extra-curricular activities

4.69 Some members of the focus groups had attended a Welsh A level Course at Glan-Illyn. The course had helped them gain a different perspective on the work. Local trips to hear poets discussing their
work and to see theatre performances were also mentioned. This was also very useful in terms of bringing the course to life.

4.70 In one of the centres, there was an A level Welsh language trip organised by the Welsh Department. The trip was one of the reasons why some of the learners chose to follow the A level course. They went to Aberystwyth University, Glan-ilyn, Tryweryn and Caernarfon. The experience was valuable because it gave learners an insight into what they were studying on the course.

Welsh A level Second Language Centres

Choosing a Welsh A level Second Language course

4.71 Learners at the school and further education centres received information from a variety of sources, including parent and teacher advice, the web (learners browsing on-line for information), a parents' evening, an open evening prospectus and an open day at a further education college.

Reasons for choosing or not choosing a Welsh A level Second Language course

4.72 In schools, the focus groups included learners who had chosen to study Welsh as well as learners who had not chosen Welsh for their post-16 studies, while learners in the further education group all studied Welsh. The learners that were studying Welsh as a subject:

• enjoyed studying languages;
• had enjoyed studying the Welsh GCSE course;
• enjoyed the creative aspect of the subject (creative writing);
• wanted to work in Welsh-speaking communities in the future and wanted to better understand Welsh culture and heritage;
• were of the opinion that studying Welsh would create more opportunities for learners in the future;
• some learners that were studying Welsh also studied STEM subjects and had decided to continue with the subject as a
contrast with scientific subjects, and because they saw the value in becoming fluent in Welsh.

4.73 The reasons that participants of the focus group did not choose to study Welsh included:

- the appeal of other subjects, especially psychology and scientific, mathematic and technology subjects.
- a perception that it is possible to study Welsh independently;
- clashes between A level subject columns on timetables at schools and colleges meant that it was not possible to study Welsh alongside other subjects of choice;
- an opinion that other languages were more useful to them than Welsh, and that a basic knowledge of Welsh was sufficient.

4.74 Opinions were mixed among members of the focus groups about enjoying studying Welsh at school. A consistent theme was the lack of sufficient learning about the culture and cultural heritage of Wales through the Welsh course (up to GCSE and beyond). There was a feeling that the A level course was better in this regard. Some were critical of the content of the GCSE course, ‘the curriculum is not that enjoyable - short stories, film and poetry are particularly boring. I want to learn the language not analyse media’. Learners studying Welsh A level mentioned that they enjoyed the experience better at this level because they were with a small group of people who wanted to learn Welsh.

First language Welsh GCSE centres

Studying Welsh GCSE

4.75 Some individuals in the first language GCSE focus groups had strong opinions about Welsh as a subject. In general, the groups liked studying Welsh, although many thought there was a need to modernise the content of the GCSE Literature course, because the themes were dated. Many learners liked the breadth of the
course – they liked the fact that there was a mix of media, such as books, poetry and film. Members of the focus groups enjoyed studying Welsh, because they had very good teachers that taught the subject in interesting ways.

Choosing A level courses

4.76 Members of the focus groups were asked about the advice they had received when choosing post-16 courses. Advice had been provided to them primarily by teachers and careers advisers, as well as discussions with their parents and some members of the current sixth-form. An ‘open evening’ and ‘options afternoon’ were held in the schools, where there was an opportunity to discuss and ask questions about each subject and discuss matters with the subject teachers. The teachers would also talk about the different courses that could be chosen.

4.77 Of the 19 participants in the first language Welsh GCSE focus groups, 11 were considering studying Welsh A level. Learners were aware of the advantages of studying Welsh, which included:

- advantages in terms of future employment;
- an opportunity for creative writing;
- it would lead to many opportunities in the future;
- the course was more interesting that other subjects; and
- Welsh was more important in life than other subjects – ‘it is a part of us and it is an honour to be able to speak Welsh’.

Learners noted that Welsh teachers at these schools were very enthusiastic, and this had an impact on some learners choosing to study Welsh.

4.78 With regard to those who did not wish to study Welsh further, there was a feeling that there was too much pressure on the examination and there was a view that the other subjects they chose were a greater priority for them in terms of future careers. In
one of the schools, it was said: ‘we all love Welsh but in school some of us do better in other subjects’.

Trips and visits

4.79 Some focus group participants had experience of visiting or listening to guest speakers at school as part of their course, e.g. hearing contemporary poets discussing poetry. These sessions brought the work to life for them as they studied the poems. A former learner who now works for S4C came to one of the schools to discuss how Welsh had helped her in her job, and this had been invaluable. Another school had seen a performance of an adaptation of a novel, and everyone enjoyed it because it ‘made the book more alive’ for them.

Second language Welsh GCSE centres

Studying Welsh GCSE

4.80 In the second language Welsh GCSE focus groups there was a view that there was a lack of attention to Welsh culture in the course. Other participants enjoyed studying themes that were relevant to young people and liked to look at the media to see how the language is being used. But there was a view that the course content needed to be changed, e.g. to include more focus on the culture and history of the language.

Choosing A level courses

4.81 Various sources of advice were mentioned by members of the groups with regard to the selection of post-16 courses/subjects, including family (parents and older siblings), the school, in particular, subject assemblies and open evenings at a sixth-form or further education colleges.

4.82 Some learners in the focus groups were eager to study a Welsh A level Second Language course to develop their skills: ‘I would like to develop my skills. I feel that I am better at Welsh than MFL I think it would be more relevant for the country’. Other participants were of the opinion that bilingualism is key to modern society and
some noted that the influence of teachers is important: ‘[teachers have] painted a positive picture of the Welsh Curriculum in my head. I aim to be bilingual by the end of my schooling’.

4.83 The reasons for learners not considering studying Welsh after the age of 16 included:

- the appeal of STEM subjects;
- an intention to move away from Wales (e.g. ‘I’m definitely leaving Wales in the future... so I don’t think I’ll never need to use it post 18’);
- the appeal of other languages (i.e. European languages, e.g. ‘I would consider as it teaches beneficial skills however I would be more inclined to take a modern foreign language since there seems to be more use for these globally’).

Choice of Career

Undergraduate students

4.84 Students who were part of the undergraduate focus group had a desire for jobs where they would work through the medium of Welsh. One member of the group was considering a career in teaching through the medium of Welsh. She wanted to teach through the medium of Welsh because she was more comfortable with the Welsh language and wanted children to learn in a language that is comfortable/natural for them.

4.85 Other careers considered by this group included working in the media, working with organisations such as the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol and Urdd Gobaith Cymru. One wanted to follow a postgraduate course, and work in the publishing industry. One member of the group commented that, ‘one of the advantages of doing a degree in Welsh is that there are many different options in front of you’.
First Language Welsh A level Centres

4.86 The career aspirations of the members of the Welsh A level groups included working in Marine Biology/Zoology, veterinary medicine, medicine, forensic psychiatry, publishing in English, teaching and Psychology. Learners' views towards studying a Welsh degree course were mixed, but some participants in each of the centres intended to pursue an undergraduate Welsh course.

4.87 Some participants did not consider pursuing a Welsh course further because other courses offered a follow-on career path; if Welsh is studied, it was not clear what career could be pursued as a natural progression. In one of the centres the group discussed that it would be beneficial to study Welsh in conjunction with another subject, e.g. journalism, as that could lead to a job with S4C for example.

4.88 There was a view that Welsh as a subject should be better promoted and more effectively promoted. A participant mentioned that the choice of universities was very limited as only a small number of universities – four or five – offer Welsh. But choosing another subject meant a choice of hundreds of universities, and if someone wanted to experience living in another area (e.g. an urban area) they were given the widest possible choice. Many of the focus groups participants were considering following undergraduate courses though the medium of Welsh.

4.89 A number focus groups participants were considering careers where they would need to work through the medium of Welsh, e.g. a doctor working in Welsh. Some wanted to live in Welsh-speaking areas and work through the medium of Welsh. ‘Work experience’ periods highlighted the importance of the Welsh language to some participants, for example in Veterinary Medicine, and they felt that it was important to be able to speak Welsh with members of the public. However, some believed they would not have many opportunities to work through the medium of Welsh in their chosen fields and in their local areas.
An interest in teaching as a career

4.90 In one of the centres, the four participants hoped to pursue careers as teachers in Welsh-medium primary schools. In another group no one wanted to be a teacher. There was some interest in a teaching career in another centre, one wanted to teach through the medium of Welsh ‘in order to be part of the community and keep the Welsh language alive’ and another participant in the centre wanted to be a Welsh teacher at a secondary school.

Welsh A level Second language centres

4.91 When discussing undergraduate courses and future careers with learners in the Welsh A level Second Language centres, there was considerable discussion of careers and courses in the fields of science, technology, mathematics, geography and psychology. Only a few students were interested in pursuing a degree in Welsh. There was one learner who wanted to study a degree but wasn’t sure what combination: ‘I would like to study German or English. Defo Welsh but not sure with what’. There was a general impression that an A level qualification was sufficient, or that there was no need for a Welsh degree to continue with the Welsh language learning journey, e.g. ‘I don’t think a degree in Welsh is necessary to continuing studying/finding a career in Wales’. There was a view that studying Welsh would limit career opportunities: ‘Studying Welsh would lower my career opportunities, it’s more beneficial to have a different degree and know Welsh’.

4.92 Some learners considered careers where there would be an opportunity to work through the medium of Welsh, e.g. medicine and midwifery, journalism and psychology. The learners who mentioned these fields recognised that the Welsh language could be of use to them if they remained in Wales. Some participants considered working through the medium of Welsh in the future, should their language skills continue to develop and their confidence in their skills increase. One said he would consider working with the Welsh Government and similar areas that value
language skills. Another participant stressed that languages are recognised as facilitation subjects by universities. In the opinion of more than one participant ‘Welsh is not essential, but it's not a hindrance’.

An interest in teaching as a career

4.93 Most of the second language learners did not consider teaching as a career. From those who did consider it, one wanted to be a Welsh teacher: ‘I want to be a Welsh teacher and inspire people to learn Welsh, as I was inspired. The language is growing, and I want to be a part of that’. Another learner considered teaching mathematics through the medium of English.

First Language Welsh GCSE Centres

4.94 Members of the groups had ideas for a range of future careers, including the police, journalism, graphic design/design, law/criminology, language teaching, and history. The following have also been identified as potential future professions: social worker, teacher, GP, dentist, architect and nuclear engineer.

4.95 Most learners associated careers in the teaching field with the use of Welsh. Other learners had not made a connection between studying Welsh with the benefits of using Welsh in the workplace. Learners who were hoping to join the police did not believe that the Welsh language was absolutely necessary, but accepted that it could be useful in the job. One wanted to work for the Welsh Government and believed that there would be an opportunity to use Welsh in such a post ‘because all the staff must be able to speak Welsh, I think’. Some in the group did not consider that the Welsh language could be advantageous in future contexts other than teaching, possibly because they do not see the Welsh language being used a great deal outside of the educational context at present.

An interest in teaching as a career
First language GCSE learners' views on pursuing a career in education were mixed. Some learners had considered pursuing a career as a teacher because they wanted to teach Welsh to others. But others did not like the idea of being a teacher and did not see the Welsh language as relevant. One declared that a career as a teacher would be his last choice, if there was no better job available. Another participant indicated that he would consider becoming a lecturer - but not an educator in a school.

**Second Language Welsh GCSE centres**

A number of Welsh GCSE Second Language focus group members had definite ideas about careers in science and technology, working for international organisations, working in the financial world and moving to London or the USA. In the opinion of one participant, his career path did not have 'any relevance to Welsh'. Another participant wished to own a business or work as an accountant: ‘either way I would like to be self-employed so speaking Welsh, although admirable, may not be essential’. Another member of the group said he felt that there is ‘a lack of information as to which jobs involve Welsh, and therefore I am not sure whether I would need it’.

An interest in teaching as a career

Welsh GCSE Second Language focus group participants did not have much desire to follow a career in teaching in the future; the majority had other careers in mind. One participant said: ‘I don’t ever want to be a teacher, ever, of any subject’.
5. Conclusions and Recommendations

5.1 Based on the evidence and opinions that were collected for this evaluation, we present our main conclusions and recommendations below.

5.2 In general, the Plan to Promote Welsh has met its goals in terms of promoting the Welsh language as a subject during the 2019-2022 period, but there have been challenges to fully implement it as a result of the Covid pandemic. In addition, there are complex challenges in many education institutions when presenting post-16 Welsh courses, which include challenges in terms of attracting learners to study Welsh A level courses, including A level courses in their current forms, and a lack of support.

5.3 The proposals of the White Paper for the Welsh Language Education Bill (Welsh Government 2023b) proposed the need for a clear and definite focus on pupils’ language outcomes. As stated in Section 2 of this evaluation, the importance of the Welsh language as an academic discipline is more evident than ever. Education is central to the Welsh Government’s vision to reach the target of one million Welsh-speakers by 2050, and ensuring the success of the Plans to Promote Welsh is an important contribution towards achieving the target. However, there are some factors that are beyond the reach of the action plan and they are referred to in the conclusions below.

5.4 The Covid pandemic had disrupted many aspects of the Fund’s operation (e.g. lack of face-to-face contact with learners, unable to hold events or activities, learners having lost confidence in their linguistic skills). Although it is simplistic to attribute only the specific effect of the Grant Fund on the increase in the numbers of learners in centres, there was evidence that numbers taking Welsh A level First...
and Second Language examinations had started to increase (JQC Statistics 2022), and anecdotal evidence that early entries for 2023 AS/A level Welsh examinations have increased.

Recommendation 1
The Welsh Government should continue to fund the annual Supplementary Grant to the Coleg for the promotion of Welsh as a subject. There is some increase in the numbers studying Welsh at A level during the implementation period of Schemes to Promote Welsh as a subject between 2019-2022, despite the challenging circumstances of the Covid period and the original Schemes to promote Welsh as a subject were not fully implemented as a result.

The Welsh in Education Fund

Although those who responded to the evaluation survey said that the summer term was an appropriate time to apply to the Fund for the following academic year, it is not certain that their opinion represents the opinion of all centres that applied to the Fund between 2019 and 2022. A Consortia representative was of the opinion that timing could be a problem as the Coleg is unable to distribute grants until it receives funding from the Government.

The vast majority of the applications by centres to the Welsh in Education Fund was for the purpose of providing experiences. In some schools, securing funding for enriching experiences (e.g. trips) could mean that some learners were not excluded from activities due to affordability. Experiences and opportunities beyond the classroom were attractive to learners when choosing to continue studying Welsh A level. Furthermore, using the funding to invite relevant speakers to centres increased learners’ understanding and enjoyment of the specifications.
5.7 The main reason for applying for provision funding to the Welsh in Education Fund was to enable centres to continue to offer Welsh A level provision to learners, despite low numbers in a centre. In some such situations the funding was used to ensure provision through e-learning methods from an external provider. The funding that is provided through the Welsh in Education Fund to a centre (up to £3,000 in 2022) is insufficient to pay for the salary of an educator; however, some centres claim that they could not maintain provision without this grant funding.

5.8 Survey respondents indicated that Welsh A level Second Language provision would not have taken place in five centres during the period of the Grant's existence unless they had received the support of the provision element of the Grant Fund. Seven of the centres that received a grant had seen an increase in the number of learners studying Welsh as a subject between 2019 and 2022, and the numbers of learners in 14 centres had remained approximately the same during this period. Being able to provide more extra-curricular opportunities increased the interest of learners in some centres.

---

**Recommendation 2**

The Coleg Cymraeg should hold a discussion with the Welsh Government, representatives of Consortia and local authorities regarding the timing of grant applications to the Fund so that centres can plan to take full advantage to use the provision and experience funding to increase the numbers that study Welsh A level.

**Recommendation 3**

The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol should encourage centres to plan their use of the Fund’s funding for experience (which could in turn increase the numbers of learners who study A Level Welsh) rather use funding for general subject resources.
5.9 There was specific planning in some centres for the use of the funding to develop specific experiences and opportunities for learners, but this does not appear to happen in all centres.

5.10 In relation to centres’ concerns about sufficient funding to be able to offer post-16 Welsh provision, Local Education Authorities have responsibilities towards ensuring opportunities to study for qualifications in Welsh as a subject as well as qualifications through the medium of Welsh in the context of achieving the objectives of Welsh in Education Strategic Plans.

Outcome 4 of the WESP asks Local Authorities to set out how they plan to achieve this. Local Authorities have a responsibility to ensure that there is Welsh A level and Welsh Second Language provision within their post-16 centres.

**Recommendation 4**
Local Authorities should be enforced to ensure that A level Welsh and Welsh Second Language provision is available to all learners within their post-16 centres.

Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol’s teaching and e-learning resources

5.11 A number of educators said that more resources were needed to teach Welsh A level, but there was little awareness among them of e-learning and digital resources for teaching Welsh that are already available on Y Porth website. Awareness of the Coleg’s e-learning resources among teachers and learners was generally low. But the reaction of those who had seen the resources was very positive.
Recommendation 5
The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol and the regional education Consortia should promote digital teaching and supporting materials and A level e-learning resources that already exist more widely among schools and colleges that offer A level provision, together with the promotion of the *Why Study Welsh* and *Turning the Tide in Thirty Years* toolkits.

Recommendation 6
In consultation with teaching centres and universities, the Coleg should continue to develop digital and e-learning resources to support Welsh teaching provision.

Materials to market and promote Welsh as a subject

5.12 There was a very high awareness of the Coleg’s materials to promote Welsh as a subject on social media among post-16 learners (although not in all centres), and those who were aware of them were generally generous in their praise. However, there was a feeling that more attention should be given to second language learners to promote the Welsh Second Language qualification. Amongst school learners, awareness was very mixed, and varied from no knowledge at all in some cases, to teachers at centres sharing the Coleg’s materials, which ensured that learners did see it.

5.13 In general, advertisements and social media posts from universities and colleges had little influence on learners’ decisions regarding their choices. Very few had seen a focus on Welsh courses or courses taught through the medium of Welsh in such material.
There was an emphasis from some learners that promotional materials should sell the university experience to prospective students. They would appreciate videos from ordinary students who share videos of a typical day at university, in order to relate to them.

**Recommendation 7**

Schemes to promote and market Welsh as a subject should pay more attention to learners who are studying Welsh as a second language to promote Welsh as a second language qualifications in relevant contexts that inspire learners.

**Recommendation 8**

Schemes to promote and market Welsh as a subject on social media should target and pay more attention to learners from diverse backgrounds and from different areas across Wales.

**Recommendation 9**

Schemes to promote and market Welsh as a subject on social media should include a wider representation of learners from Black, Asian and ethnic minority backgrounds.

**Internship Scheme**

The Internship Scheme had generally worked well during 2022. Responsibilities were tailored to the interest of the interns, and varied between the universities. The interns collaborated well with the Coleg’s officer, but some of them felt that there could be a better connection with the Welsh Department at their university. Much of their work had involved creating content for social media and university open days, but there was some feeling that closer links should be developed with schools and with younger learners than those studying A level.
Influencing the decisions of learners to choose Welsh courses

5.16 The evidence presented by educators and learners for the evaluation showed that challenges faced by centres in recruiting learners on A level courses include: learners do not value Welsh, a perception that STEM subjects lead to places in prestigious universities and successful careers, a lack of specialist staff to teach Welsh, a lack of support for English-medium schools, parents' attitudes towards the Welsh language and shortcomings in Welsh GCSE and A level courses.

5.17 The reasons that learners choose to study Welsh A level, or not, are varied. Reasons included that Welsh was their strongest subject and that they enjoy studying elements of the Welsh course. The positive influence of university open days on their decisions was noted, because this gave them an opportunity to discuss the undergraduate Welsh course and the importance of Welsh within the university.

5.18 The reasons for not choosing to study Welsh tended to involve the fact that other curricular subjects were given more of a priority in terms of future careers, and the appeal and emphasis on scientific subjects.

5.19 Various sources of information and advice influence learners' subject choices. There was a lack of awareness among learners of the value of Welsh in the world of work. Attitudes from the past that Welsh is not of any value to get ahead in the world have re-emerged in some areas and influenced the decision of learners

Recommendation 10
The Coleg should continue to develop the Internship Scheme and encourage closer collaborative working with Welsh departments at universities to develop Schemes to promote Welsh as a subject with learners in schools and colleges.
not to continue studying Welsh after a period of compulsory education. There were suggestions that people who studied Welsh, and who work in various fields, should be asked to promote the subject to challenge the stereotype that studying Welsh is limiting in terms of career.
**Recommendation 11**

*Schemes to promote Welsh as a subject* should include action by Mudiad Meithrin, The National Centre for Learning Welsh, Local Authorities, the Welsh Government and the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, to work together with parents and families to get learners interested in the Welsh language from an earlier age.

**Recommendation 12**

Information should be offered by Local Authorities to parents from all backgrounds which highlights the relevance of Welsh to contemporary Wales and promotes the benefits of learning more than one language at a young age.

**Recommendation 13**

The Welsh Government, the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol and Local Authorities should consider the possibility of introducing language awareness programmes for post-14 and post-16 learners, together with parents/carers.

**Recommendation 14**

*Schemes to promote Welsh as a subject* should target learners more widely than A level pupils in the post-16 period. There are opportunities to do this through elements of AS, Welsh Baccalaureate and the Onwards With Welsh qualifications.*

**Recommendation 15**

*Schemes to promote Welsh as a subject* should include individuals that have studied Welsh, and that work in various career fields to promote the subject in order to challenge the stereotype that studying Welsh limits you in terms of career.

**Recommendation 16**

The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol and their partners should create promotional material that covers a range of careers that require the use of Welsh as part of the job requirements, including careers in the STEM world.

---

* The aim of Onwards With Welsh, which is currently offered through the National Centre for Learning Welsh, Colegau Cymru and e-sgol, is to provide Welsh sessions to second language learners between 16 and 18 years of age, that do not intend to continue to study Welsh A level Second Language.
Welsh GCSE courses

5.20 Educators and learners alike referred to the impact of the content of Welsh GCSE courses on learners’ decisions and that there is a need to teach Welsh in a more contemporary way than is currently done. There were calls for changes in the courses and a focus on developing communication, translation and translanguaging skills.

5.21 Educators and learners also said that there was a real need to reform the current GCSE courses. Qualifications Wales and the WJEC have commenced discussions on the content of Welsh GCSE and Welsh GCSE Second Language qualification specifications for learners aged 14 to 16, to support the Curriculum for Wales, following a period of public consultation.

Recommendation 17
The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol should draw the attention of Qualifications Wales and the WJEC to the calls in the data for this evaluation to create specifications that are contemporary and appealing to 14-16 year old learners.

A career in education

5.22 In general, few learners who took part in the evaluation were interested in pursuing a career in the field of education. There are implications in this regard for the Welsh Government's plans to develop the Welsh teaching workforce, and ensure growth in undergraduates who choose Welsh as a degree subject and subsequently teaching as a career.
Recommendation 18
The Welsh Government, the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol and their partners should further develop their plans to promote teaching as a career, to increase the interest of learners and undergraduates in a field which is key to increasing the number of primary and secondary teachers who can teach through the medium of Welsh, and increase the number of learners who can speak Welsh by 2050.

Recommendation 19
The Welsh Government should carry out further research into the reasons why teaching is not an attractive career for learners and undergraduates who study Welsh, in view of the growing need for teachers to teach Welsh in the Welsh education system, and increase the number of learners who are able to speak Welsh by 2050.
6. Bibliography

Estyn (2014). Linguistic progression and standards of Welsh in ten bilingual schools

https://www.estyn.gov.wales/system/files/2021-08/A%2520level%2520Welsh%2520First%2520Language_0.pdf


OB3 (2019). Research among young people to discover their views and perceptions of studying Welsh as a subject

https://www.qaa.ac.uk/docs/qaa/subject-benchmark-statements/subject-benchmark-statement-welsh.pdf?sfvrsn=83c3cb81_14


Welsh Government (2019). Improving the Planning of Welsh-Medium Education – Recommendations of the Welsh in Education Strategic Advisory Board: 


Welsh Government (2021b) *Guidance on school categories according to Welsh-medium provision:*  


Welsh Government (2023 a). *A level entries and results (pupils aged 17 only) by subject group:*  

Welsh Government (2023b). *Proposals for a Welsh Language Education Bill:*  


7. **Appendix**

Educator’s Survey
Gwerthusiad o gynlluniau hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg fel Pwnc ar ran y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol
Evaluation of Schemes to promote Welsh as a Subject on behalf of y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol

Arolwg / Survey

Mae’r Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol (CCC) wedi comisiynu IAITH i gynnal gwerthusiad o gynlluniau a weithredwyd i hyrwyddo’r Gymraeg fel pwnc mewn ysgolion, y sector addysg bellach a’r sector addysg uwch gyda chyllid Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystod 2018/19–2021/22. Bydd y gwerthusiad terfynol yn cael ei rannu gyda Llywodraeth Cymru.

Fel rhan o’r gwerthusiad, rydym yn gofyn am safbwyntiau a phrofiadau addysgwyr mewn ysgolion a cholegau drwy gyfrwng arolwg ar-lein.

Byddem yn ddiolchgar iawn o gael eich cymorth i gwrblhau'r 23 cwestiwn canlynol. Dylai'r arolwg gymryd tua 20 munud i'w gwblhau. Bydd yr holl ddata yn cael ei gasglu, ei storio a'i brosesu yn unol à gofynion GDPR fel y nodir yn yr hysbysiad preifatrwydd yma.

Yn yr holiadur hwn mae cwestiynau ynghylch ‘Crofnfa'r Gymraeg mewn Addysg’. Ers 2019, mae’r CCC yn darparu cyllid (hyd at £3,000) o'r gronfa hon i ysgolion a Cholegau Addysg Bellach ledled Cymru sy’n cynnig Cymraeg Safon Uwch (iaith gyntaf ac ail iaith). Mae’r grantiau yn cael eu rhannu at ddau ddiben: sicrhau darpariaeth pwnc y Gymraeg mewn ysgolion/colegau addysg bellach, a chyfoethogi profiad disgyblion sy’n astudio’r Gymraeg fel pwnc.

The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol (CCC) has commissioned IAITH to undertake an evaluation of schemes to promote Welsh as a subject in schools, the further education sector and the higher education sector with Welsh Government funding during 2018/19–2021/22. The final evaluation will be shared with the Welsh Government.

As part of the evaluation, we are asking for the perspectives and experiences of educators in schools and colleges through an online survey.

We would be very grateful to have your assistance in completing the following 23 questions. The survey should take approximately 20 minutes to complete. All data will be collected, stored and processed in accordance with GDPR requirements as set out in this privacy notice.
In this questionnaire, there are questions regarding the 'Welsh in Education Fund'. Since 2019, the CCC has been providing grants (of up to £3,000) from this fund to schools and further education colleges across Wales that provide Welsh A Level (first and second language). These grants are available for two purposes: to secure Welsh subject provision in schools/further education colleges, and/or to enrich the experience of pupils studying Welsh as a subject.

**Manylion ysgol /coleg School/college details**

1. Enw ysgol/coleg: school/college name:

2. Eich rôl yn yr ysgol/coleg: Your role in the school/college:

3. Mae’r ysgol/coleg yn cynnig: (ticiwch fel sydd yn berthnasol)
The school/college provides: (tick as applicable)

| TGAU Cymraeg Iaith (Iaith Gyntaf) GCSE Welsh Language (First Language) |
| TGAU Llenyddiaeth Gymraeg GCSE Welsh Literature |
| Safon Uwch Cymraeg (Iaith Gyntaf) Welsh (First Language) A Level |
| TGAU Cymraeg Ail Iaith GCSE Welsh Second Language |
| Safon Uwch Cymraeg Ail Iaith Welsh Second Language A Level |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Niferoedd oedd yn</th>
<th>TGAU Cymraeg Iaith</th>
<th>TGAU Llenyddiaeth Gymraeg</th>
<th>TGAU Cymraeg</th>
<th>Safon Uwch Cymraeg</th>
<th>Safon Uwch Cymraeg</th>
<th>Cwrs Carlam (Ail Iaith)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
4. Ydy'r ysgol/coleg wedi gwneud cais am gyllid o Gronfa'r Gymraeg mewn Addysg rhywbryd rhwng 2018/19 a 2021/22?

Has the school/college made an application for funding from the Welsh in Education Fund sometime between 2018/19 and 2021/22?

Do Yes

Naddo No

Os ‘do’ ewch i gwestiwn 6, os ‘naddo’ ewch i gwestiwn 5.

If ‘yes’ go to question 6, if ‘no’ go to question 5.
5. Why didn’t you apply for funding from the Welsh in Education Fund sometime between 2018/19 and 2021/22?

- not aware of the fund
- did not complete the form in time
- the school doesn’t have an A level class
- applied for the money later than 2021/22
- other

6. For which academic years did the school/college apply to the Fund? (Tick all relevant years)

- 2019-20
- 2020-21
- 2021-22

7. For what reasons did the school/college apply? (Tick the answer(s) that are applicable)

- to secure Welsh language A-Level provision
2. i gyfoethogi profiadau disgyblion Blwyddyn 12 a/neu 13 (coleg blwyddyn 1 a 2) sy’n astudio'r Gymraeg
to enrich the experiences of Year 12 and/or 13 pupils (college year 1 and 2) studying Welsh

3. arall
other

8. Beth oedd y prif resymau dros wneud cais am gyllid i Gronfa'r Gymraeg mewn Addysg?
What were the main reasons for applying for funds from the Welsh in Education Fund?

9. A oedd cais yr ysgol/coleg yn llwyddiannus ar unrhyw achlysur?
Were the applications of your school/college successful on any occasion?
Oedd Yes
Nag oedd No

10. Yn eich barn chi a ydy cyflwyno'r cais ar-lein yn hwylus?
In your opinion is applying online easy?
Ydy Yes
Nac No

Dim profiad o gyflwyno cais ar-lein
No experience of applying online

11. Yn eich barn chi, a ydy'r amser gwneud ceisiadau i'r Gronfa (gwahoddir ceisiadau am gyllid o'r Gronfa yn ystod tymor yr haf ar gyfer y flwyddyn academaidd ganlynol) yn addas?
In your opinion, is the time window for making applications to the Fund suitable (applicants are invited to apply for the Fund during the summer holidays so that the money can be spent during the subsequent academic year)?
Ydy Yes
Nac ydy No
Os nac ydy, pryd fyddai’r amser gorau/delfrydol/mwyaf addas i agor y gronfa?
If ‘no’, what time would be best/most convenient/most suitable to open the fund?

**Defnyddio Cyllid/ Using Funds**

12. Sut mae’r cyllid mae’r ysgol/coleg wedi ei dderbyn o Gronfa'r Cymraeg mewn Addysg wedi cael ei ddefnyddio i gefnogi profiad neu ddarpariaeth Safon Uwch Cymraeg?
   Rhowch enghreifitiau penodol os gwelwch yn dda.
   How have the funds that the school/college has received from the Welsh in Education Fund been used to support A level experiences or provision?
   Please give specific examples.

13. A ddaeth unrhyw newid (yn sgil eich defnydd o'r cyllid i gefnogi profiad/darpariaeth Safon Uwch Cymraeg) o ran eich darpariaeth o'r Gymraeg fel pwnc yn yr ysgol/coleg?
   Did any changes occur (following your use of the funds to support A level experience/provision) in terms of your provision of Welsh as a subject in the school/college?
   Do Yes
   Naddo No
   Eglurwch os gwelwch yn dda.
   Please explain.

14. Beth fyddai wedi digwydd petaech chi heb gael y cyllid?
   What would have happened had you not received the grant/s?

**Cefnogaeth a heriau/ Support and challenges**

15. A yw'r niferoedd sy'n astudio Safon Uwch Cymraeg yn eich ysgol/coleg wedi cynyddu, gostwng neu aros tua'r un fath rhwng 2019 - 2022?
   Have the numbers that study Welsh A Level in your school/college increased, decreased, or remained about the same between 2019-2022?
   Cynyddu
   Increased
Gostwng
Decreased

Aros tua’r un fath
Remained about the same

Yn eich barn chi, beth yw’r prif resymau dros unrhyw newid ystyrlon yn y niferoedd sy’n astudio Safon Uwch Cymraeg ers 2019?
In your opinion what are the main reasons for any significant changes in the numbers that study Welsh A Level since 2019?

16. A oes heriau wrth recriwtio dysgwyr i astudio cwrs Safon Uwch Cymraeg yn yr ysgol/coleg?
Are there challenges in terms of recruiting learners to study A Level Welsh in the school/college?

Oes Yes
Nag oes No

Os oes, beth yw’r heriau?
If yes, what are the challenges?

17. A oes digwyddiadau eraill i hyrwyddo’r Gymraeg fel pwnc (ac eithrio digwyddiadau wedi eu trefnu gyda nawdd y CCC) yn digwydd yn yr ysgol/coleg?
Are there any other events to promote Welsh as a subject (excluding events that have been organised with funds from the CCC) that occur in the school/college?

Oes Yes
Na No

Os oes, pa fath o ddigwyddiadau ydynt?
If yes, what kind of events are they?

15. Yn eich barn chi, a oes cefnogaeth ddigonol i athrawon a darlithwyr addysgu Safon Uwch Cymraeg yn yr ysgol/coleg?
Do you think there is adequate support for teachers and lecturers to teach Welsh A-levels at school/college?

Oes Yes
Na No
Os na, pa fath o gefnogaeth fyddai'n ddefnyddiol?
If no, what kind of support would be useful?

**Dilyniant i addysg uwch / Progression to higher education**

16. Ers 2019, faint o ddysgwyr o'r ysgol/coleg sydd wedi mynd ymlaen i astudio’r Gymraeg mewn cwrs prifysgol?
Since 2019, how many learners from the school/college have gone on to study Welsh as a university course?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Blwyddyn</th>
<th>Nifer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2021</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2022</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Adnoddau eraill sydd yn cael eu darparu gan y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol Other resources provided by the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol**

17. Ydych chi wedi derbyn pecyn *Pam Astudio’r Gymraeg* gan y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol?
Have you received a *Why Study the Welsh as a Subject* pack from the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol?

Do  Yes
Naddo  No

Os do, pa ddefnydd ydych chi wedi ei wneud o'r pecyn?
If yes what use have you made of the resource?

18. Ydych chi wedi defnyddio adnoddau *Pecyn Hyrwyddo’r Gymraeg fel Pwnc* ar gyfer nosweithiau rheini?
Have you used the Promoting Welsh as a Subject Pack for parent evenings?

Do Yes
Naddo No
Os do, pa ddefnydd ydych chi wedi ei wneud o’r pecyn?
If ‘yes’ what use have you made of the resource?

19. Ydych chi wedi defnyddio modiwl Troi'r Trai mewn Tri Deg Mlynedd yn yr ysgol/coleg?
Have you used the Turning the Tide in Thirty Years module in school/college?
Do Yes
Naddo No
Os ‘do’, pa ddefnydd ydych chi wedi ei wneud o’r adnodd?
If ‘yes’ what use have you made of the resource?

20. Ydych chi wedi gweld deunyddiau marchnata a hyrwyddo'r pwnc gan y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol ar y cyfrngau cymdeithasol e.e. Instagram (@DyDdyfoddolDi a @InstaGymraeg) Twitter (@DyDdyfoddolDi a @CymraegCCC)?
Have you seen content on social media, from Y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, marketing and promoting the subject e.g. Instagram (@DyDdyfoddolDi and @InstaGymraeg) Twitter (@DyDdyfoddolDi and @CymraegCCC)?
Do Yes
Naddo No
Os ydych wedi gweld y deunyddiau, beth yw eich barn am eu haddaswydd ar gyfer dysgwyr eich ysgol/coleg?
If you have seen the materials, what do you think of their suitability for your school/college learners?

21. Ydych chi’n cyfeirio dysgwyr yr ysgol/coleg at ddeunyddiau hyrwyddo a marchnata’r pwnc gan y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol ar y cyfrngau cymdeithasol e.e. Instagram (@DyDdyfoddolDi a @InstaGymraeg) Twitter (@DyDdyfoddolDi a @CymraegCCC )?
Do you refer school/college learners to social media content by Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol promoting and marketing the subject e.g Instagram (@DyDdyfoddolDi a @InstaGymraeg) Twitter (@DyDdyfoddolDi a @CymraegCCC)?
Ydym Yes
Nac ydym No

Os mai na yw'r ateb, beth yw'r rheswm dros hynny?
If the answer is no, what is the reason for that?

22. A oes gennych unrhyw awgrymiadau pellach am sut y gellid cynyddu nifer y dysgwyrr sydd yn astudio Safon Uwch Cymraeg?
Do you have any further suggestions on how the number of learners studying Welsh A-levels could be increased?

23. Diolch yn fawr i chi am eich amser a'ch sylwadau wrth ymateb i'r cwestiynau. Rydym yn gwerthfawrogi hyn yn fawr iawn. A fyddech yn fodlon cymryd rhan mewn cyfweliad byr pellach dros y ffôn / yn rhithiol yng Nghynlluniau Hynwyddo'r Gymraeg fel Pwnc?
Thank you very much for your time and for your responses to the questions. We really appreciate this. Would you be willing to take part in a further short telephone/virtual interview about the Schemes for Promoting Welsh as a Subject?

Byddwn Yes
Na fyddwn No

Os ydych yn fodlon a wnewch chi ddarparu manylion cyswllt e-bost os gwelwch yn dda.
If you are prepared to be interviewed, please provide your email contact details.

Bydd eich cyfeiriad e-bost yn cael ei storio a'i brosesu yn unol â gofynion GDPR fel y nodir yn yr hysbysiad preifatrwydd yma. Your email address will be stored and processed in accordance with GDPR requirements as set out in this privacy notice.

Diolch yn fawr.
Thank you very much.